

*Return to an Address of the Honourable the House of Commons
dated 14th July 2004
for the*

**Review of Intelligence
on
Weapons of Mass Destruction**

**Report of a Committee
of
Privy Counsellors**

Chairman:

The Rt Hon The Lord Butler of Brockwell KG GCB CVO

Ordered by the House of Commons to be printed 14th July 2004

TABLE OF CONTENTS

| | Paragraphs | Pages |
|--|------------|-------|
| MEMBERS OF THE COMMITTEE | | i |
| TABLE OF CONTENTS | | iii |
| TERMINOLOGY AND GLOSSARY | | ix |
| INTRODUCTION | | 1 |
| Our Terms of Reference | 1 | 1 |
| Our Work | 2-7 | 1 |
| Our Approach | 8-12 | 3 |
| Definitions and Usage | 13 | 3 |
| WMD | 14 | 3 |
| CBW | 15-16 | 4 |
| CBRN | 17 | 4 |
| Our Thanks | 18-19 | 4 |
| Chapter 1 THE NATURE AND USE OF INTELLIGENCE | | 7 |
| 1.1 Introduction | 20-22 | 7 |
| 1.2 Collection | 23-26 | 8 |
| 1.3 Validation | 27-29 | 9 |
| 1.4 Analysis | 30-32 | 10 |
| 1.5 Assessment | 33-40 | 10 |
| 1.6 The Joint Intelligence Committee | 41-46 | 12 |
| 1.7 The Limitations of Intelligence | 47-52 | 14 |
| 1.8 Risks to Good Assessment | 53-58 | 15 |
| 1.9 The Use of Intelligence | 59 | 16 |
| Chapter 2 COUNTRIES OF CONCERN OTHER THAN IRAQ AND GLOBAL TRADE | | 17 |
| 2.1 Introduction | 60-63 | 17 |
| 2.2 AQ Khan | | 17 |
| Introduction | 64 | 17 |
| What Was Known | 65-72 | 18 |
| Validation | 73 | 19 |
| Conclusions | 74-75 | 19 |
| 2.3 Libya | | 20 |
| Introduction | 76-78 | 20 |
| What Was Known | 79-80 | 20 |
| Use of the Intelligence | 81-82 | 21 |
| Validation | 83 | 21 |
| Conclusions | 84 | 22 |

| | Paragraphs | Pages |
|--|-------------------|--------------|
| 2.4 Iran | | 22 |
| Introduction | 85-87 | 22 |
| What Was Known | 88-92 | 22 |
| Validation | 93-94 | 23 |
| Conclusions | 95-96 | 24 |
| 2.5 North Korea | | 24 |
| Introduction | 97-98 | 24 |
| What Was Known | 99-102 | 25 |
| Validation | 103-104 | 25 |
| Conclusions | 105-106 | 26 |
| 2.6 General Conclusions | 107-109 | 26 |
| Chapter 3 TERRORISM | | 29 |
| 3.1 Scope | 110 | 29 |
| 3.2 The Period up to 1995 | 111-114 | 29 |
| 3.3 1995-1997 | 115-116 | 31 |
| 3.4 1998-1999 | 117-121 | 31 |
| 3.5 2000-2001 | 122-124 | 33 |
| 3.6 The Aftermath of 9/11 | 125-127 | 34 |
| 3.7 Intelligence on UBL's Capabilities and its Validation | 128 | 35 |
| Nuclear | 129 | 35 |
| Chemical | 130 | 35 |
| Biological | 131-132 | 35 |
| 3.8 Intelligence Responses to International Terrorism | 133-136 | 36 |
| Chapter 4 COUNTER-PROLIFERATION MACHINERY | | 37 |
| 4.1 Introduction | 137 | 37 |
| 4.2 Departmental Responsibilities | 138-142 | 37 |
| 4.3 Co-ordination | 143-147 | 37 |
| 4.4 The Role of Intelligence | 148-150 | 38 |
| Chapter 5 IRAQ | | 41 |
| 5.1 Introduction | 151-154 | 41 |
| 5.2 1990-1998 | 155 | 42 |
| Iraq's Nuclear Weapons Programme | 156-171 | 42 |
| Iraq's Chemical Weapons Programme | 172-182 | 45 |
| Iraq's Biological Weapons Programme | 183-189 | 48 |
| Iraq's Ballistic Missile Programme | 190-206 | 49 |
| Summary | 207-209 | 52 |
| 5.3 1998-March 2002 | | 53 |
| The Policy Context | 210-217 | 53 |
| Iraq's Nuclear Weapons Programme | 218-225 | 55 |

| | Paragraphs | Pages | |
|-------------|--|---------|-----|
| | Iraq's Chemical Weapons Programme | 226-235 | 56 |
| | Iraq's Biological Weapons Programme | 236-245 | 58 |
| | Iraq's Ballistic Missile Programme | 246-254 | 60 |
| | Summary | 255-258 | 63 |
| 5.4 | March-September 2002 | | 64 |
| | The Policy Context | 259-269 | 64 |
| | Iraq's Prohibited Programmes | 270-281 | 67 |
| | Policy Development, April-August 2002 | 282-288 | 70 |
| | JIC Assessments, August-September 2002 | 289-307 | 71 |
| 5.5 | The Government's Dossier of September 2002 | | 76 |
| | Introduction | 308-312 | 76 |
| | The Genesis of the Dossier | 313-319 | 77 |
| | Presenting Intelligence to the Public | 320-327 | 78 |
| | The Intelligence Behind the Dossier | 328-332 | 79 |
| | The Accuracy of the Dossier | 333-341 | 82 |
| | Lessons for the Future | 342 | 87 |
| 5.6 | September 2002-March 2003 | | 87 |
| | The Scope of JIC Assessments | 343-345 | 87 |
| | Iraqi Capabilities | 346-351 | 87 |
| | Deception and Concealment | 352-354 | 89 |
| | Reliability of Human Intelligence Reports | 355 | 89 |
| | Use of the Intelligence | 356-364 | 89 |
| | Summary | 365 | 92 |
| 5.7 | The Role of Intelligence in Assessing the Legality of the War | 366-387 | 93 |
| 5.8 | What Has Been Found in Iraq Since the War | | 97 |
| | Introduction | 388-392 | 97 |
| | What the Iraq Survey Group has Found | 393-396 | 98 |
| | Conclusions | 397 | 99 |
| 5.9 | Validation of Human Intelligence Sources | | 99 |
| | Introduction | 398 | 99 |
| | Context | 399-401 | 99 |
| | SIS Main Sources | 402-405 | 100 |
| | Liaison Service Sources | 406-409 | 101 |
| | Summary of Main Sources | 410 | 101 |
| | Other Sources | 411-412 | 102 |
| | SIS Validation Procedures | 413-423 | 102 |
| 5.10 | Conclusions on Iraq | | 104 |
| | The Policy Context | 424-432 | 104 |
| | The Sources of Intelligence | 433-445 | 107 |
| | Assessment | 446-448 | 109 |
| | The Treatment of Intelligence Material | 449 | 110 |

| | Paragraphs | Pages |
|------------------|--|-------------|
| | The Effect of Departmental Policy Agendas | 450 110 |
| | Access to Technical and Other Expertise | 451-452 110 |
| | Quality of JIC Assessments | 453-459 111 |
| | The Use of Intelligence | 113 |
| | The Government's Dossiers | 460-469 113 |
| | Intelligence and the Legality of the Use of Military Force | 470-472 115 |
| | Validation of the Intelligence | 473-474 116 |
| Chapter 6 | IRAQ: SPECIFIC ISSUES | 119 |
| 6.1 | Introduction | 475 119 |
| 6.2 | Links between Al Qaida and the Iraqi Regime | 476 119 |
| | The 'Poison Cell' in Kurdish Northern Iraq | 477-480 119 |
| | Co-operation between the Iraqi Regime and Al'Qaida | 481-484 119 |
| 6.3 | Operation Mass Appeal | 485-489 120 |
| 6.4 | Uranium from Africa | 490-503 121 |
| 6.5 | The 45-Minute Claim | 504-512 125 |
| 6.6 | Mobile Biological Weapons Laboratories | 513 127 |
| | Intelligence on Mobile Biological Agent Production Facilities | 514-523 127 |
| | Validation | 524-527 129 |
| | Mobile Facilities Discovered Post-War | 528-530 130 |
| 6.7 | Aluminium Tubes | 531 130 |
| | Background | 532-533 130 |
| | The Emerging Intelligence Picture | 534-545 131 |
| 6.8 | Plague and Dusty Mustard | 134 |
| | Plague | 546-559 134 |
| | Dusty Mustard | 560-565 136 |
| 6.9 | Dr Jones's Dissent | 566-568 137 |
| | Use of the Available Intelligence Material | 569-572 137 |
| | The Handling of Intelligence | 573-578 138 |
| 6.10 | Oil Supplies | 579 139 |
| Chapter 7 | CONCLUSIONS ON BROADER ISSUES | 141 |
| 7.1 | General Conclusions About Intelligence and its Use | 580 141 |
| | Other Cases | 581-582 141 |
| | International Co-operation | 583-584 141 |
| | Co-ordination of Counter-Proliferation Activity | 585 142 |
| 7.2 | Intelligence Machinery | 142 |
| | The Defence Intelligence Staff | 586-590 142 |
| | The Joint Intelligence Committee | 591-597 143 |
| | The Assessments Staff | 598-601 144 |
| 7.3 | Intelligence Assessments | 145 |
| | The Language of JIC Assessments | 602-604 145 |
| | JIC Assessments | 605 146 |
| 7.4 | Machinery of Government | 606-611 146 |

大量破壊兵器に関するインテリジェンスの検証

英国枢密顧問官委員会のレポート

目次

| | |
|---------------------|----|
| 第5章 イラク | 41 |
| 5.1 イントロダクション | |
| 5.2 1990-1998 | |
| イラクの核兵器計画 | |
| イラクの化学兵器計画 | |
| イラクの生物兵器計画 | |
| イラクの弾道ミサイル計画 | |
| 要約 | |
| 5.3 1998-2002年月 | |
| 政治的背景 | |
| イラクの核兵器計画 | |
| イラクの化学兵器計画 | |
| イラクの生物兵器計画 | |
| イラクの弾道ミサイル計画 | |
| 要約 | |
| 5.4 2002年3月-9月 | |
| 政治的背景 | |
| イラクの禁止されていた計画 | |
| 政策の発展、2002年4月-8月 | |
| JIC 調査、2002年8月-9月 | |
| 5.5 政府のドシエ、2002年9月 | |
| イントロダクション | |
| ドシエの発端 | |
| インテリジェンスの国民への提示 | |
| ドシエの背後にあるインテリジェンス | |
| ドシエの正確性 | |
| 将来への教訓 | |
| 5.6 2002年9月-2003年3月 | |
| JIC 調査の範囲 | |

イラクの能力

欺瞞と隠匿

人的情報源からの報告の信頼性

インテリジェンスの利用

要約

5. 7 戦争の法的正当性を調査するにあたっての
インテリジェンスの役割

5. 8 戦争以来イラクで何が見つかったか

イントロダクション

イラク調査団が見つけたもの

結論

5. 9 人的情報源の検証

イントロダクション

背景

SIS の主な情報源

連携機関の情報源

主要な情報源の要約

他の情報源

SIS の検証手続